Doc. GA47/EC46/REP/16

FORTY SEVENTH PLENARY SESSION OF THE PABSEC GENERAL ASSEMBLY ECONOMIC, COMMERCIAL, TECHNOLOGICAL AND ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS COMMITTEE

REPORT*

«Problems of Refugees, Displaced Persons and Irregular Migrants in the BSEC Member States – Economic Aspects»

Rapporteur: Mr. Sabri OZTURK (Turkey)

^{*} The text was considered and adopted at the Forty Sixth Meeting of the Economic, Commercial, Technological and Environmental Affairs Committee in Yerevan on 16 March 2016 and approved by the 47th General Assembly in Moscow on 29 June 2016

I. INTRODUCTION

- 1. During the 45th meeting of the PABSEC Economic, Commercial, Technological and Environmental Affairs Committee in Varna on 5 October 2015 it was decided to consider the issue of "Problems of Refugees, Displaced Persons and Irregular Migrants in the BSEC Member States Economic Aspects" as the main issue of the 46th meeting of the Committee.
- 2. The problem of refugees, i.e. persons who are forced to leave their countries of origin or permanent settlement and seeking asylum in other places, has turned into a global problem of todays' world. At present international community takes lots of efforts to meet the new challenges and threats of migration and border security, as well as to find necessary solutions.
- 3. According to the information by the UN, there are more than 60 million refugees in the world. Today, constantly increasing number of refugees come from the Middle East and Africa because of the civil wars, natural disasters, famine, extreme poverty, diseases, unemployment and poor economic development.
- 4. While the war in Syria continues with violence against peaceful population the flow of Syrians leaving the country increases. The number of refugees to Turkey and through Turkey to European countries also grows. Emergence of a large numbers of refugees cause social and economic tensions and makes difficult to find solution to such economic issues as competition for low-paid work places, recruitment of illegal workers, low salaries, increased rents, high inflation, etc.
- 5. There is no doubt that suffering of the people must be met with sympathy and they have to be assisted, however, the states on the territories of which there are huge number of refugees, face challenges, including solution of urgent economic problems. This forces the governments and international organizations to seek answers to the serious problems posed by the need to accommodate refugees and to ensure their integration into new places of settlement.
- 6. The present report focuses on the economic aspects of the problems of refugees in the BSEC member states. The Report uses the information provided by the national delegations of Armenia, Azerbaijan, Bulgaria, Georgia, Moldova, Romania, Russia, Turkey and Ukraine. In addition, the reference material has been obtained by the PABSEC International Secretariat from the relevant sources of the Internet.

II. PROBLEMS OF REFUGEES, DISPLACED PERSONS AND IRREGULAR MIGRANTS IN THE BSEC MEMBER STATES – ECONOMIC ASPECTS

7. According to the report on Trends in International Migration published by the UN Department of Economic and Social Affairs (DESA) the number of international migrants has increased from 173 million people in 2000 to 244 million in 2015. According to the Global Trends Report of the UN High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) published in Geneva in June, the number of internally displaced persons in the world in 2014 reached 59.5 million people, which is 8.3 million more than in 2013. The experts point to the unprecedented high rate of growth in the number of people leaving their homes due to armed conflict, persecution and natural disasters. In 2014 average of 42.5 thousand people the fled from their homes every day, becoming refugees, internally displaced persons or asylum seekers. According to the UN High Commissioner for

- Refugees the world enters a "new era in which the scale of global forced displacement is clearly dwarfing anything seen before".
- The UN Convention relating to the Status of Refugees, which gives a definition of "refugee" and sets out the general grounds on which the refugee status is granted was adopted on 28 July 1951 in Geneva and entered into force on 22 April 1954. As stated in the Convention, the term "refugee" refers to a person who "owing to well-founded fear of being persecuted for reasons of race, religion, nationality, membership of a particular social group or political opinion, is outside the country of his nationality and is unable or, owing to such fear, is unwilling to avail himself of the protection of that country". It is assumed that a state has to guarantee the rights of the refugees for work, free recruiting, receive of public and social assistance. Refugees have the possibility to receive financial aid as a minimal subsistence level, and medical and legal aid. There are also significant advantages including the possibility for refugees to receive free primary education to continue their studies in higher and secondary educational institutions, to receive scholarships. The Convention prohibits any discrimination against refugees. Refugees have some rights like the citizens of the host countries, and some - like foreign citizens. The Convention permits the expulsion of a refugee in the interests of national security, but prohibits their return to the country from which they fled, in order not to be persecuted. Refugees are also given the possibility to practice their religion freely, to obtain movable and immovable property.
- 9. Economic problems faced by refugees are mostly related to employment. For the majority of internally displaced persons and refugees the prime concern is to adapt in a foreign country, to get used to the new laws and regulations. In fact, the refugees take professions at low-level service sector or crafting in order to take their place in the labour market.
- 10. On the other hand, states harbouring the refugees make mass purchases of food and consumer goods for refugees, rent residential containers, pay for services and housing appliances, provide bus drivers, interpreters and doctors, and all these greatly stimulates the internal market. The positive development on the labour market is urgent creation of new jobs.
- 11. In a special study of the UNHCR (of 9 July 2015), dedicated to the conflict in Syria, it is said that the number of Syrians in the region, who fled the country, was more than 4 million 13 thousand people in 2015. In Turkey there are 45% of people who had fled from Syria, which is more than 1.8 million people. In June to Turkey arrived 24 thousand more Syrians. In addition, more than 270 thousand Syrians have applied for asylum in Europe. Experts estimated that in 2015 for the assistance to refugees and harbouring countries in the region was allocated 5.5 billion USD. As of the end of June only 24% of the required amount was received from the donors.
- 12. According to information by the UNHCR for the first six months of 2015 in Europe through the Mediterranean arrived 137 thousand migrants and refugees 83% more than in the same period last year, when the number was 75 thousand people. One third of those who arrived in Greece and Italy by sea were Syrians. According to expert estimates, the eastern route of migration across the Mediterranean from Turkey to Greece is the most popular one. According to the UNHCR data the number of drowned and missing migrants and refugees as a result of shipwrecks reached a peak in April 1308 people. In May 68 such cases were recorded and in June 12. According to the information published on 10 July 2015 in Geneva by the International Organization for

Migration (IOM), in the beginning of the year about 150 thousand migrants and refugees came to Europe through the Mediterranean sea and most of them were accepted in Greece. According to the IOM 75.9 thousand people arrived in Greece and about 74.9 thousand in Italy.

Situation in the BSEC Member States

- 13. In **Armenia** until 1999 protection of the rights of refugees was observed by the Council of Ministers of the Republic of Armenia and the Government of the Republic of Armenia in the framework of about 150 Resolutions aiming at providing refugees with housing, food, employment, pensions, allowances and solution of other urgent issues. On 3 March 1999 the National Assembly of the Republic of Armenia adopted the "Law on Refugees", which established procedure and conditions for temporary settlement on the territory of the Republic of Armenia of persons seeking refugee status, granting of refugee status or refusing it, loss of refugee status, as well as the competences of the state body in charge of refugee issues, rights and obligations of the applicant for refugee status, guarantees of their legal and social protection.
- 14. In order to expand the rights of refugees in accordance with international standards the National Assembly of the Republic of Armenia adopted a new law "On Refugees and Asylum" on 27 November 2008. This law grants the asylum-seekers in the Republic of Armenia, as well as foreign nationals, recognized refugees and persons without citizenship broader social and cultural rights within the international standards. Furthermore, in matters of labour law they are granted the rights equivalent to the rights of the citizens of the Republic of Armenia, except for the jobs requiring the citizenship of the Republic of Armenia.
- 15. 11 normative legal acts were adopted in 2009-2010 out of which 8 are Resolutions of the decision of the Government of the Republic of Armenia, and 3 departmental normative acts on recognition of the authorized state body on migration, settlement of asylumseekers in temporary accommodation centres, providing living conditions, issuing a asylum-seeker certificate, providing the persons with refugee status conventional travel documents, registration of applications for granting asylum in border crossing points of the Republic of Armenia.
- 16. On 26 September 2001 the National Assembly the Republic of Armenia adopted the "Law on Political Asylum" of the Republic of Armenia and respective government resolutions that set the relations with foreign nationals and well-known public and political figures under political persecution, legal mechanisms for the implementation of the constitutional right of the President of the Republic of Armenia associated with the solution of the question of granting political asylum to them in the Republic of Armenia. This law regulates the basis for granting the right to political asylum to foreign citizens and stateless persons, the procedure, terms of termination of such rights, as well as other associated relations. By the Resolutions of the Government of the Republic of Armenia the authorized state body was established which considers the application for asylum (the Migration State Service of the Ministry of Territorial Administration and Emergency Situations), applications for asylum, a list attached to these papers, registration and case management, as well as providing temporary shelter and necessary living conditions of asylum seekers and persons with political asylum, the procedure for issuing certificates on the right to political asylum and travel documents to persons seeking political asylum.
- 17. Certain laws and government resolutions regulate social and technical issues of the refugees deported in 1988-1992. According to these laws displaced refugees, including

those who have received the citizenship of the Republic of Armenia, are given apartments in residential buildings on the territory of the Republic of Armenia and cottage type houses as the property rights of the refugees with the help of the state budget of the Republic of Armenia, foreign states and international organizations. Also there are the rules for listing the refugees with housing needs, setting the priorities for giving housing at state budget expense, including also granting them the houses for accommodation. If a refugee lives in the residential compounds for more than three years and takes the citizenship of the Republic of Armenia he/she can privatize occupied residential area free of charge. Residential compounds belonging to private partnerships and joint-stock companies cannot be privatized in the framework of this resolution.

- 18. The Government of the Republic of Armenia approved and currently implements measures aimed at solving the problems of refugees concerning the harmonization of national legislation of the Republic of Armenia with international standards (in order to expand the rights) and to ensure their effective integration into the society. In 1993 by the Resolution of the Supreme Council the Republic of Armenia acceded to the main international instruments on the rights of refugees the 1951 Geneva Convention relating to the Status of Refugees and in its framework undertook international commitments relating to the protection of the rights of refugees.
- 19. At present in **Azerbaijan** there are more than 1 million 200 thousand refugees and IDPs forcibly expelled in 1988-1994. Azerbaijan is one of the countries with the highest numbers of internally displaced persons (IDPs) per capita. In the early years the vast majority of IDPs were accommodated in 12 camps and they lived in extremely difficult conditions. By the Decrees of the President of the country the state programs were launched to improve the living conditions and to increase employment rate of refugees and IDPs. As a result of these measures state programs were successfully implemented and implementation of new measures continues.
- 20. In 2001, the first resources of the Oil Fund were channelled to improving the living conditions of refugees and IDPs. In 2007 the 12 refugee camps were eliminated. As a whole, with the resources allocated by the State Oil Fund and other sources of financing until today in more than 30 cities and districts were built 94 modern residential complexes with complete socio-technical infrastructure totalling to 2.9 million square meters. The new residential areas were built 150 schools, 6 music school, 1 art school, 1 Palace of Culture, 50 cultural centres, 59 kindergartens, 58 health centres and 2 of the Olympic sports complexes, and also was constructed 718 km of roads, 960 km of water supply lines, 1605 km of overhead electric transmission lines, 442 km gas pipelines, 66 km of communications lines, 26 kilometres of heat supply lines, 89 km of sewage lines, 163 km of drainage system, and 830 electric transformers of different capacity. Also the Ministry of Finance provided funds with which 2700 IDP families or 13,500 people have received from the state new apartments. With the state budget resources allocated for IDPs are paid monthly allowances for food (18.15 manat (14.40 USD) per person). Monthly wages continue to be paid to almost 9 thousands of displaced persons, who before worked in the budget enterprises and organizations and due to the reasons beyond their control lost their jobs and could not recover. 78 ministries, committees, companies, corporations, joint stock companies and other centralized organizations responsible for the cities and districts provide different types of assistance to IDPs during holidays.
- 21. By the Presidential Decree of 6 December of 1999 the Social Development Fund of IDPs was established with the aim to assist the development of infrastructure securing temporary accommodation of IDPs. In general the credit agreements concluded between

the World Bank and the Government of Azerbaijan in 2003-2015 served as the basis for rendering the aid of 350 thousand people through the IDP Social Development Fund that resulted in 590 different micro-projects and 11 thousand IDPs got 8 million manat (6.35 million USD) in the form of micro-credit. Thus, the program provided assistance to 50 thousand internally displaced persons. This fund is also a commissioner of project of construction of new residential complexes.

- 22. Relevant measures are taken to increase the employment level of internally displaced persons and to reduce their poverty level. Over the past 12 years out of 380 thousand employable IDPs 161,000 people received permanent jobs in the public sector and other spheres, 200 thousand people were temporarily employed, 4340 people were registered as unemployed, 2,716 people received vocational training courses, 1.901 million people were recruited for paid public works and 16 thousand families received targeted social assistance. Within the framework of the National Fund for Entrepreneurship Support of the Ministry of Economic Development of the Republic of Azerbaijan 2000 IDPs received preferential loans, which have been allocated in the amount of 40 million manat (31.74 million USD) to finance investment projects of entrepreneurs. In general, to solve the problems of refugees and internally displaced persons 5.4 billion manat (4.3 billion USD) has been spent over the past 22 years.
- 23. In **Bulgaria** the increased number of migrants entering the territory of the EU Member States and in particular the territory of the Republic of Bulgaria, has created risks leading to the occurrence of a humanitarian crisis. For the maintenance of a large number of asylum seekers significant financial resources are required which were not planned in advance and were allocated for the Bulgarian society. This creates conditions for tension among certain social groups. At the same time the international financial experts note that mass immigration could be an unprecedented opportunity for the Bulgarian and the European economy as a whole because of the rapid aging of society and the increasingly obvious workforce shortage in certain areas of the economy.
- 24. The assessment of the effects of the integration of foreigners in the labour market in the Republic of Bulgaria has been made on the basis of official data of the State Agency for Refugees (SAR) about the number of persons seeking asylum and the number of persons who are granted the status of refugee or a humanitarian status. According to the official data of the Employment Agency (EA) the amount that was planned for the implementation of the employment and training programmes for refugees in 2014 and 2015 were fully utilised.
- 25. Along with the low qualification level of refugees a standing problem is the language barrier, as well as some features of the ethnic and religious belonging. Integration of refugees in the labour market is primarily through the employment bureaus. According to information published by the Minister of Labour and Social Policy, the number of refugees who are registered in the employment bureaus is not more than 100 persons. According to reports of the Employment Agency, the programme for training and employment of refugees in 2014 and 2015 included 75 persons and 104 persons for the period from January to September 2015.
- 26. According to the State Agency for Refugees, the expenses per month per refugee equal about 352 BGN. The amount of 26,223 thousand BGN was allocated in 2015 for the persons who have obtained refugee status within the year and respectively 34,714 thousand BGN in 2016, and 38,960 thousand BGN in 2017. This estimate is approximate

- as it is based on the total annual number of persons who have been granted refugee status and their average monthly maintenance according to the SAR.
- 27. In the spending for the refugee issues a significant share belongs to the budgetary spending of the Ministry of Interior. An increase has been also planned in the budgetary spending of the State Agency for Refugees for 2015 and for the 2016. Also some amounts are envisaged in the budget of the Ministry of Labour and Social Policy with the aim to deal with the refugee crisis and to implement social integration and social welfare programmes.
- 28. The specific geographical location of Bulgaria and the fact that it is situated close to the region with growing crisis makes it rather vulnerable. Therefore, it is important to take responsibility in dealing with migration pressure by all Member States. Efforts should be concentrated on strengthening border controls at the external borders, thus avoiding uncontrolled entry of persons who clearly do not need international protection and fall into the category of economic migrants. The latest steps of the European Commission aimed at establishing a European Border and Coast Guard Agency are in this direction; the Agency will have significantly expanded powers compared to the current Frontex; and steps have been also taken to change some of the rules in the Schengen Borders Code.
- 29. Limiting the mass influx of third country nationals or stateless persons can be achieved by allocating them before they enter the EU territory (e.g. in refugee camps outside the EU with the help of the UNHCR), through the mechanism for resettlement. Thus, an effective distribution of migrants among the EU Member States could be achieved. If efforts are focused on taking additional measures for the allocation of foreigners before they enter the territory of the EU, this will contribute to achieving fair distribution of applicants among the EU Member States. It is expected that the migration pressure on the EU will continue and be relatively intensified.
- 30. In **Georgia** under the national legislation and international obligations asylum-seekers, refugees and humanitarian status holders have right to work. In this regard they have the same social rights as the aliens in case of self-employment, as for the hired work they enjoy the same rights as the citizens of Georgia. Today refugees and humanitarian status holders get 45 GEL (18 USD) monthly allowances (like IDPs) from the Government of Georgia. 453 600 GEL (181 440 USD) was spent for 1 116 persons in this regard in 2015. The Government of Georgia also fully finances the service of asylum-seekers Reception Centre designated for 60 persons in Martkopi (228 234 GEL (91 293 USD) in 2015).
- 31. The asylum-seekers, refugees and humanitarian status holders are involved in the State Health Program. As for the recent update, 170 beneficiaries were involved in this program with overall budget of 74 011 GEL (29 604 USD). The refugee issues are included in the Migration Strategy of Georgia for 2016-2020 and the respective Action Plan, which was approved in 2015. The Migration Strategy of Georgia for 2016-2020 encompasses comprehensive state policies regarding the migration related issues, while its Action Plan further comprehends detailed activities for the successful implementation of state policy on migration. The Migration Strategy for 2016-2020 reflects integrated state migration policy. The Plan of Action defines more detailed actions for successful implementation the migration policy. Migration strategy includes such issues of the asylum seekers, refugee and humanitarian status holders as: providing integration programs and state services (education, healthcare, etc.) for the asylum seekers, refugees

- and humanitarian status holders in the capital as well as in the regions; further development of the intensive program about the language, culture and legislation basics and offering courses; providing accommodation for asylum-seekers by establishing additional reception centre in Martkopi.
- 32. The asylum related issues are also enshrined in the National Action Plan of Georgia within the Association Agreement between the European Union and the European Atomic Energy Community and their Member States, of the one part, and Georgia, of the other part. The Action Plan of the Government of Georgia also enshrines the asylum related issues including enhancement institutional and legal framework of asylum system in Georgia as well as protection of asylum-seekers, refugees and humanitarian status holders.
- 33. Georgia has faced several challenges in the process of enhancement the asylum system on the way of fulfilling its international obligations encompassed under the international instruments. It has to be stressed that Georgia has begun active cooperation with the European Union and it is responsible for the approximation of its legislation with the EU in the framework of Association Agreement, Visa Liberalization Action Plan as well as under the Agreements between the EU and Georgia on Visa Facilitation and Readmission. On the way of enhancing its legislation Georgia mobilized its efforts for improving asylum procedures, dealing with mass influx situations, strengthening Status Determination Procedures, as well as guaranteeing integration rights for the beneficiaries.
- 34. Georgia is an active member in several international panels and processes, such as Prague Process, Eastern Partnership, Mobility Partnership, etc. Georgia dynamically cooperates with the International Centre for the Migration Policy Development (ICMPD) and with its support has held Cooperation Agreement with Lithuania regarding the exchange of information about the asylum-related issues. In 2015 Georgia held Cooperation Agreement with the Austrian Centre for Country of Origin and Asylum Research and Documentation (ACCORD).
- 35. Georgia has been suffering from the forced displacement for over two decades now. The first wave of internal displacement took place in Georgia in 1992-93 followed by the second largest wave in 2008. As for today, the total number of registered IDPs is 269 157. The part of the IDPs was placed in collective centres, schools, kindergartens, factories and different administrative buildings, and part of the IDPs found a solution to the problem individually. At that time, approximately 45% of IDPs were living in the collective centres that were built for different purposes, were unusable for long-term, and frequently, even short-term accommodation.
- 36. Today the approach had radically changed and IDP issues became one of the main priorities of the Georgian Government. In October of 2014 Georgian Government approved "Project on transferring lawfully owned living spaces into IDP's private ownership", which was put into effect on 1 November 2014. Under the project, more than 10 000 IDP families became owners of real estate. IDPs get an increased allowance of 45 GEL per month. This provision applies to those whose registered income per month is below 1,250 GEL (including taxes). In addition, the Ministry of IDP and Refugees of Georgia offers financial assistance for vulnerable IDP families. The assistance entails issuing one-time grants and covering the rent costs.
- 37. **Greece** is the country that receives 95% of refugees and migrants who wish to reach Europe. 43% of these desperate people are refugees from Syria, 34% are children and 21% are women. In 2015, 856.723 refugees and migrants arrived in Greece through the

sea route in the Eastern Aegean, which is about 20 times more than the figure in 2014, while inflows in 2016, just for the months of January-February, amounted to about 130.000 persons, three times higher than the total of 2014 inputs. The related cost for receiving and managing these flows is over 1,8 billion euros so far. The Greek position from the start has been the management of mixed flows through burden sharing at the European level, on the basis of solidarity and humanitarian principles and abiding by the European and International law, avoiding unilateral actions by member-states, which could result in burdening asymmetrically our country as first country of entry. Identifying the related costs and producing accurate results, is not easy, as many different entities are involved (ministries, decentralized administration, municipalities, hospitals, and other bodies) and the refugee/migration flows along with the crisis in Syria are still developing. Given that migration policy will be implemented as designed, according to the EU standards, the financial cost to serve the migrant/refugee flows are estimated around 920 million euros, for 50.000 refugees/immigrants.

- 38. Up to now, for handling the migrant/refugee crisis, Greece has secured around 1.749.685.109 euros for the period 2014-2020. According to the costing analysis of the Ministry of Migration and Ministry of National Defense, the yearly operation cost per camp is of a total amount of 31.540.000,00 € (for open reception facilities structures for 4,000 people). An overall estimation in million euros stands as follows: Ministries 656.42; Decentralized administration 5.65; Municipalities 17.01; Hospitals 14.50; Legal Entities Central Government 4.56; Other bodies 36.07; Total 698.14. The public spending per person/per day, according to the records of the General Government Budget is estimated, as follows: The cost for Hot Spots 27,9; Open Reception Facilities (camps) 21,6; Hotel vouchers 23,4; Apartment Vouchers 15,2; Temporary solutions (tents) 10.
- 39. In order to facilitate the monitoring of the economic impact of the r/m flows to the Greek Economy, the Ministry for Finance has assigned the General Accounting Office (GAO) with the project of for the registering of costs and the training of the entities in registering properly the costs, (by releasing questionnaires and guidelines, mapping and meeting with all entities involved, cross-checking with "needs-assessment-estimation" etc.) to serve the above purpose.
- 40. In Moldova the Division for refugees of the Bureau for migration and asylum is a subdivision of the Ministry of Internal Affairs and is responsible for the administration and settlement of issues of asylum seekers, refugees and of the beneficiaries of humanitarian or temporary protection. The Division for refugees of the Bureau for migration and asylum: a) registers the applications of asylum seekers, conducts interviews with them, collects data and evidence necessary to complete the file for each application for asylum; b) undertakes protection and assistance measures offered to asylum seekers and to beneficiaries of a form of protection; c) proposes the establishment, if necessary, of accommodation centres for asylum seekers and refugees and manages these centres; d) is responsible for the management of the funds allotted thereto, of other aid, as well as the financial assistance granted to asylum seekers and refugees by national and international organisations; e) carries out other duties in the field of refugees and asylum as provided by the legislation of the Republic of Moldova. Other authorities competent to receive applications for asylum: Border police; Police authorities; Units of the Department of Penitentiary Institutions of the Ministry of Justice or the subunits of provisional detention within the law enforcement authorities.
- 41. The Department of border police of the Ministry of Internal Affairs has 10 rooms for temporary reception of asylum seekers with a total capacity of 27 beds. Among them, 3 asylum rooms are located at the Moldovan-Romanian border, 6 rooms are located at the

- Moldovan-Ukrainian border and one room at the Border Police Office of Chisinau International Airport. However, the foreigners are not provided with food, hygiene items and other primary items during their temporary support at the border state.
- 42. The Republic of Moldova cooperates with the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) based on the collaboration agreement signed between the Government of the Republic of Moldova and the UNHCR. The Republic of Moldova is part to international migration partnerships: Prague Process, Eastern Partnership Panel on Migration and Asylum, Budapest Process. On 15-16 December 2015 in Stockholm, Sweden the second phase of Asylum Systems Quality Initiative in Eastern Europe and South Caucasus implemented by UNHCR was launched. The project beneficiaries are the authorities responsible for asylum applications examination in the administrative phase, border control authorities and state courts in Armenia, Azerbaijan, Belarus, Georgia, the Republic of Moldova and Ukraine. The project is focused on institutional capacity building and improvement of the asylum procedures quality within the states involved in the project.
- 43. As of 1 January 2016, a total number of 560 persons were registered with the asylum system of the Republic of Moldova, out of which: 114 asylum seekers (in the application examination phase), 144 refugees and 302 beneficiaries of humanitarian protection. In 2015 an increase in the number of asylum applications was recorded. During 2015, a total number of 273 asylum applications were submitted, as compared to 245 asylum applications filed in 2014. As for the countries of origin, there were no major changes recorded. Therefore, in 2015, the majority of asylum seekers came from Ukraine 123, Syria 55, Iraq 23, Afghanistan 19, Sri Lanka 7, etc.
- 44. Although the analysis and data collected by the authorized services of the Republic of Moldova do not indicate risks of an immediate inflow of foreigners in the Republic of Moldova, the Prime Minister ordered the creation of two working groups for the development of the Contingency Plan (plan of activities and structures responsible for the implementation of the measures of reception, identification, status granting and potential assistance measures for refugees). The first group includes the representatives of the Ministry of Internal Affairs: Bureau for migration and asylum, Border Police Department, Carabineer Troops Department, etc. The second group is an inter-ministerial one and includes the representatives of the Ministry of Internal Affairs, Ministry of Defence, Ministry of Health, Ministry of Labour, Social Protection and Family, Ministry of Education, Ministry of External Affairs and European Integration, Ministry of Culture, Intelligence and Security Service, General Directorate for decentralisation policies and local administration within the State Chancellery.
- 45. The main threat for **Romania** is represented by the foreigners coming to Turkey, Bulgaria and Greece from Syria, Middle East and North Africa due to the country's geographical position on the main routes used by illegal immigrants. On 16 September 2015 the Government of Romania approved the National Strategy on Immigration for 2015-2018 and the Action Plan 2015 in view to ensure access to asylum for those who need protection, a better quality of according it and faster and more reliable decisions on asylum.
- 46. The Strategy aims at effective management of immigration and includes strategic objectives, targets and actions which reflect the policies adopted at European level, harmonized with the national realities. The effective management of immigration will be pursued by addressing gaps in specific skills and attracting highly skilled workers, a more robust approach to illegal immigration and readmission, including better

- cooperation with third countries, to protect those who need help through a firm asylum policy
- 47. The new financial framework in the field of migration and asylum covers the period 2015-2020 and represents a wider instrument, ensuring the integrated and effective management of the migratory influx at the EU level, as well as compliance with the principle of solidarity and fair sharing of responsibility. Covering existing deficit on the labour market by attracting highly skilled people will contribute to protecting the citizens. Full transposition and effective implementation of the Common European Asylum System (CEAS) represents a priority for Romania.
- 48. The Strategy envisages several measures to stimulate the investments, creating jobs as well as supporting the competitive reforms, in order to speed up the economic growth. In order to encourage the foreign investments in Romania, the authorities create the necessary framework to attract the potential investors, as well as third-country nationals whose presence is necessary for the proper implementation and development of the investments.
- 49. Romania has allotted in 2015 humanitarian assistance for the migration and refugee crisis management totalling approximately 955,000 euro, as follows: - 150,000 USD intended for Syrians refugees inside the territory of Iraq, Jordan and Turkey. The amounts allotted to alleviate the crisis in Syria and Iraq were ordered as follows: 50,000 USD for refugees in Turkey through the Turkish authorities; 50,000 USD for refugees from the Jordan territory through the Jordanian authorities; 50,000 USD for mitigation humanitarian crisis in Iraq by funding a UNHCR project aimed at strengthening the water distribution network capacity in the town of Soran (Iraq) for the benefit of Syrian refugees, displaced people and host community members; 226.000 EUR emergency humanitarian aid for Jordan following the amplification of the refugee crisis; 224.000 EUR emergency humanitarian aid for Serbia in support of refugee population and the management of the 100.000 USD unaffected contribution to crisis on migration, consisting in supplies; UNHCR; for the period 2016-2017 is provided an additional contribution of 200,000 USD; 300.000 EUR in the period 2015-2017, contribution to the World Food Program (WFP), the first instalment of 100,000 EUR will be paid in the current year; 100.000 EUR to the EU Trust Fund emergency contribution for stability and addressing the root causes of irregular migration and displaced persons in Africa (EUTF Africa); 80.000 EUR contribution to the EU Trust Fund regional response to the Syrian crisis (EUTF Madadi).
- 50. In **Russia** according to the Main Directorate for Migration Affairs of Ministry of Interior of Russia (MDMA) as of 1 November 2015 10.2 million foreign citizens were settled with different reasons. Among them 332 thousand citizens of Ukraine with temporary residence permit and more than 113 thousand with a residence permit; more than 326 thousand citizens of Ukraine who have refugee status or temporary asylum status. Also by the end of 2015 in Russia were registered about 7 thousand Syrian citizens, including about 4500 with temporary residence permit or a residence permit in Russia. Out of 8.5 thousand citizens of Afghanistan on the territories of Russia 4,3 thousand have permit for temporary residence and 1 thousand people with refugee status or temporary shelter. The massive influx of refugees into the country has led to the need to take a number of important political and organizational decisions for the reception of refugees and their settlement (rapid development of legislation, allocation of funds, and coordination of federal and regional authorities).

- 51. The problems of refugees are regulated within the framework of the Action Plan to implement the State Migration Strategy for the period to 2025 and other social programs. An integrated system of granting asylum to foreign nationals is established in the Russian Federation and is constantly developing and is regulated by the Federal Law "On Refugees". An important element of the asylum system is temporary accommodation centres for asylum seekers.
- 52. Refugee status is indefinite. Refugees undergo registration once in 1.5 years. Temporary shelter is an additional form of protection for those who are denied the refugee status. Temporary asylum is granted in accordance with Article 12 of the Federal Law "On Refugees".
- 53. The Main Directorate for Migration Affairs currently has four temporary accommodation centres for persons applying for refugee status, with the capacity of 500 places. An important activity in the process of the implementation of State Migration Strategy of the Russian Federation is to promote international cooperation of the Russian MDMA in the sphere of migration, both on a bilateral basis as well as with relevant foreign agencies, leading international integration organizations, platforms and forums.
- 54. The priority areas of international activities are the development of cooperation with the partner countries in Eurasia, Asia and Middle East, as well as the strengthening of Russia's international capacity in the area of migration through cooperation with the institutions of the United Nations, Shanghai Cooperation Organization, and BRICS.
- 55. Today about 11 million foreign citizens and stateless persons live on the territory of the Russian Federation with different purposes. Given the current situation and due to migration crisis in Europe there is increased attention of foreign partners to the effective experience of the Russian Federation in the sphere of regulation of migration flows, combating illegal migration and international protection. Within the framework of the practical implementation of the Migration Strategy in the period until 2025 the opportunities for legal stay of migrants have been extended and the work is undertaken to increase efficiency of measures to combat illegal migration. The system for the temporary detention of foreign citizens and stateless persons, subject to administrative expulsion from the Russian Federation, deportation or readmission successfully operates. As a result of the legislative measures significant increase is noted in the numbers of legally employed workers (in Russia for the last three years, their number has increased by more than 1 million), and decrease of number of violators is noted that is a significant measure for ensuring stability of general migration climate.
- 56. In the context of escalation of migration problem the Russian Federation improves its migration legislation, including granting asylum to foreign nationals on its territory. The necessary infrastructure to work with migrants is developed also including the asylum-seekers in the Russian Federation. For example, at the present on the territory of 57 subjects of the Russian Federation 236 temporary accommodation centres (TAC) are deployed in which almost 9 thousand people live, including more than 2.6 thousand children. TACs are opened or closed upon the necessity by the executive authorities of the subjects of the Russian Federation who are also responsible for the conditions in these centres. The citizens after their arrival are distributed among the subjects of the Russian Federation with due regard to the capacity in the centres. Necessary funds are allocated from the federal budget for the organization of receive and distribution of foreign nationals, determination of their legal status on the territory of the Russian Federation, assistance and their integration into the Russian society.

- 57. In **Turkey** one of the topical issues now is to solve the problem of refugees from Syria and to ensure border security. The impact of refugees on the economy generates both risks and opportunities.
- 58. The main impact of the big flows of refugees into the economy in border areas was the increase in rental prices. In this situation, favourable conditions are created for the owners of the apartments in the border areas as their income increases but tenants have problems because of the increased rental rates and high demands. In the border areas of Turkey the cost of living and prices on food, goods, services and accommodation are increasing. As an example in the cities of Gaziantep and Kilis inflation is much higher than the average inflation rate in Turkey.
- 59. Migration is putting pressure on the labour market. Migrants are competing for low-paid jobs saturating the market with cheap labour force especially in industrial and agricultural sectors. According to the survey by "ORSAM" in the border areas of Turkey the people who have lost their jobs primarily blame appearance of large number of Syrian refugees. This has an extremely negative reaction of the local population who believe that foreigners replace them in the labour market. Also some companies illegally recruit cheaper workers which results in an "unfair competition" between the companies, which leads to more tension.
- 60. On the other hand, it should be noted that most of the humanitarian goods for the Syrians living in the refugee camps in Turkey and Syria are purchased from the local Turkish manufacturers. Also the aid for the Syrians from all over the world is delivered through the local Turkish firms operating in the border areas. This contributes to increase production in the textile and food industries in a difficult economic situation in the region. For example, the volume of exports from Gaziantep to Syria totalled to 133 million USD in 2011, while this figure increased to 278 million USD in 2013.
- 61. Although the majority of Syrian refugees are representatives of low income class there are also rich investors and businessmen coming to Turkey, particularly from the city of Aleppo. Syrians with higher incomes prefer to live in the port city of Mersin due to the existing strong trade relations between Turkey and Syria, as well as in the city of Gaziantep. Number of Syrian companies registered in the city of Gaziantep has increased significantly as compared with the 2011.
- 62. Despite the increase in capital inflows from Syria, according to experts, more opportunities to invest in the Turkish economy were lost. According to the Chamber of Industry of Gaziantep 25 billion USD were transferred from Syria to Europe but it is likely that the volume of investments from Syria to Turkey will be increased. Another example of contribution of Syrian refugees in the Turkish economy is strengthening of trade relations between Turkey and the Middle East countries through trade ties of traders from Aleppo, which help to deliver Turkish goods to the Middle East markets.
- 63. The refugees although in a modest scale but are trying to start their business and open shops, bakeries and shoe repairs whose clients are the Syrians themselves. However, much of these activities is illegal causing resentment of the local population and creates an unhealthy competition among the entrepreneurs.
- 64. Illegal trade between the border villages also was practiced before but with the start of the civil war and deepening of the crisis the volumes of illegal trade also increased. Moreover, smuggling business is now controlled by a few numbers of families, while before the crisis it was a lucrative business for many more people. It is especially necessary to emphasize the activities of illegal groupings in fuel smuggling in Kilis.

- 65. In view of the rapid increase in the number of Syrian citizens in Turkey enjoying temporary protection, 13 April 2012 international community responded to the appeal of Turkey and took the decision to share the burden of the refugee problem. With the aim to get financial aid for the needs of Syrian citizens the Office for the Prevention and Elimination of Consequences of Emergency of the Government of Turkey (AFAD) opened bank accounts and circulated respective information to the representatives of the international community.
- 66. Given the increasing number of Syrian citizens seeking asylum in Turkey on 14 August 2012 AFAD together with the relevant authorities had prepared a list of the necessary products for the Syrian citizens and handed it to the Turkish branch of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR). The total amount of bilateral and multilateral international assistance provided to Turkey as of November 2014 totals to about 265 million USD. At the same time UNHCR has developed a regional plan for the regulation of the refugee problem. As part of this plan in 2013 UNHCR appealed for help in the amount of 3 billion USD. By the end of 2013 71% of this amount has been received. On 16 December 2013 the necessary assistance in the amount of 522 million USD was announced within the framework of the Regional plan for the regulation of the refugee problem in 2014. On 3 July 2014 the volume of this aid has been revised and the amount of 497 million USD was adopted. Yet, as of November 2014 only 28 percent of the amount was received (this is the lowest rate in the region).
- 67. 221 thousand Syrian refugees live in 22 camps in Turkey. Since October 2012 a system of electronic food card of 60 TL is introduced for Syrians living in the camps in the framework of the joint project of the World Food Programme (WFP) and the Turkish Red Crescent. As of June 2014 within this project approximately 214,000 Syrians in the 21 camps received these cards.
- 68. **Ukraine** due to its geopolitical position in the centre of migration flows is widely involved in global migration processes as a country of reception, transfer and transit of migrants. Despite the undoubted successes in shaping the legislative framework in the field of migration, until recently, there were no well-defined areas of the State Migration Policy of Ukraine, its strategic goals and objectives, and, in fact, the most important link was missing the migration service focusing on the core issues of this sphere. Now such a body is created, it started to operate and the process of mobilising necessary resources and personnel is going on.
- 69. In 2001 the new version of the Law of Ukraine "On Refugees" was adopted which is in full conformity with the international practice and in which the procedure for obtaining refugee status by foreigners and stateless persons is significantly changed. In order to strengthen the control over the decision-making process a two-tier system of reviewing applications was introduced which allowed improved efficiency in decision-making on the granting refugee status and strengthen the responsibility of officials at all levels in issuing recommendations on granting refugee status.
- 70. In order to ensure the implementation of the Action Plan on visa liberalization by the European Union to Ukraine and to implement the Migration Policy of the country the national system of asylum granting has been improved. The problem was the absence in Ukraine, unlike in other European countries, of the legal institutions for assistance and temporary protection, which was out of the framework of human rights protection principles. A significant number of foreigners and stateless persons, who were in Ukraine, could not be granted refugee status because of non-compliance with the terms stipulated in the law "On Refugees". At the same time, their return to the state of their

- nationality or former residence was impossible because of environmental, technological or other emergency circumstances.
- 71. So the foreigners and stateless persons were staying in Ukraine without any status exposed to all the negative consequences arising from this situation. In May 2011 by the Decree of the President of Ukraine the Concept of Migration Policy of Ukraine was approved. It is important that this strategic document not only determines the state priorities in the field of migration but also formulates specific tasks of the public authorities for the implementation of this concept.
- 72. One of the objectives of the concept is sustainable improvement of legislation on refugees, preparation and adoption of legislation on the provision of additional or temporary protection or asylum in Ukraine to foreigners and stateless persons.
- 73. The main countries of origin of refugees are Afghanistan (1142), Armenia (195), Azerbaijan (129), Russian Federation (102), Syria (59), Sudan and the Democratic Republic of the Congo (55 each), Iran, Iraq (45 each). Persons identified as needing additional protection in Ukraine Syria (352), Afghanistan (82), Somalia (50) and Iraq (22).
- 74. In accordance with Article 14 of the Law of Ukraine "On refugees and persons in need of additional or temporary protection" persons recognized as refugees or as people who needs additional protection enjoy the same rights and freedoms and take the same duties as the citizens of Ukraine, except in cases established by the Constitution and the laws of Ukraine, as well as international treaties against which Ukraine has responsibilities by the decision of the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine.
- 75. According to the Ministry of Social Policy of Ukraine as of 1 February 2016 there are 1,704,937 displaced persons or 1,346,276 displaced families from the Donbas and Crimea. 714,867 families have applied for the assistance, 669,487 of which already got it. Internally displaced persons (IDPs) are often referred to as refugees since they also fled from the war.
- 76. The Law of Ukraine "On ensuring the rights and freedoms of internally displaced persons" ensures realization of Ukraine's constitutionally guaranteed rights and freedoms of citizens of Ukraine, creation of appropriate conditions of social adaptation, provision of temporary settlement, assistance in finding employment, continuing education for the internally displaced persons. In addition, it is envisaged to protect them from discrimination and forced returns and to provide assistance in case of voluntary return.
- 77. All IDPs are entitled to receive financial assistance for accommodation totalling to 884 UAH (40 USD) for disabled persons and 442 UAH (20 USD) for employable persons. Allowance to one family may not exceed 2400 UAH and is paid by the state for six months. Altogether in the budget of 2015 was envisaged the amount of 3.4 billion UAH for the payment to the IDPs.

III. CONCLUDING REMARKS

78. Economic aspect of the problems refugees implies employment, lack of housing, financial assistance, etc. Increased number of refugees generates social and economic tensions and complicates solution of such economic issues as competition on the labour market, recruiting illegal workers, increased rental rates, high inflation, illegal deals, etc. However, the flow of refugees can have a positive impact on the economy with the condition that the refugees manage to quickly and successfully integrate.

- 79. The concern for the situation in the labour market and security in the country together with increased negative attitudes towards migrants give rise to conflicts between local communities of the harbouring countries and refugees. At the same time prejudice in the minds of citizens of the harbouring countries grows that may lead to social tensions.
- 80. The solution to the refugee problems depends on a number of factors of internal and external political situation that have also to be taken into consideration. Sharing the experience of other states dealing with large flows of refugees for many years will enable countries to improve the existing laws and streamline contradictions with international regulations.
- 81. Migration is a global challenge that requires global efforts. In the era of globalization closed borders and policy adjustments in the field of granting asylum cannot radically change the current migration situation, which is proved by the mounting numbers of illegal movement of people. It is necessary that countries help each other in solving the problem of illegal migration. It is also necessary to strengthen cooperation between the organizations, both international and regional, and to take into account the experience of countries where the successful integration of immigrants into the surrounding society is practiced.